Effectiveness of the Four Comprehension Strategies of Reciprocal Teaching in Enhancing Grade Two Learners' Achievement in Reading

DIZAMINE C. LLURAG
Teacher I
Western Leyte College
Master of Arts in Education
Major in Elementary Education
dizamine.cabiling@deped.gov.ph

ABSTRACT

The purpose of the present study is to evaluate the four comprehension strategies of reciprocal teaching in enhancing grade two learners' achievement in reading as it is evident that most of the grade two learners find difficulty in understanding the text read. A quasi-experimental research design employing pre-test and post-test using the researcher-made reading test, the researcher employed differentiated reading activities and materials allowing the engagement of the learners in the reading activities highlight the intervention of this study. Simple percentage and t-test of mean difference were the statistical tools used to evaluate the result of the study. The study revealed a significant difference in the reading performances of the grade two learners before and after the integration of the four comprehension strategies in reciprocal teaching. Integrating teaching in small groups with differentiated reading activities based on the four comprehension strategies like predicting, questioning, clarifying, and summarizing motivates the learners to achieve positive reading performance. Involving the learners in a dialogue with the teachers where they take turns on the role of the teacher leading the discussion about the text had given the learners to confidently explain about the text read. In reciprocal teaching, the learners are encouraged to actively engage with the text, fostering a deeper understanding and improved comprehension skills. From the learning materials used like incorporating images on the text, headlines or introductory statements which guides the learner in knowing and understanding the concepts conveyed in the story and identifying the role that each character in the story stands and selecting a variety of texts or topics which includes fiction, non-fiction, articles, and multimedia are instruments in making the intervention effective. Hence, researchers encourage every teacher to apply or adopt reciprocal teaching techniques to improve the reading comprehension skills of the learners.

Keywords — Effectiveness, Four Comprehension Strategies, Reciprocal Teaching, Grade Two Learners' Achievement, Reading

I.   INTRODUCTION

Reading is something we do every day. When we don't read carefully, or when we don't understand what we read, we make mistakes that matter. We might misunderstand the instructions of the medicines we will be taking or misread the direction from the food pockets which are not supposed to be edible. Reading is a vital skill, even, and especially, as we increasingly use technology. However, many elementary and high school students read far below grade level. This is very evident in the result of the pre-reading test conducted by the researcher. It was revealed that among the 34 pupils tested, most of them are found frustration level of readers. There are even pupils who can understand the story read but

failed to discuss freely about the story. As the researcher examined the result of the test, the pupils lack comprehension on the four reading strategies which are predicting, questioning, clarifying, and summarizing.

Teaching reading is multi-faceted and complex. There is a growing need for students to learn enhanced reading skills. Students need these skills for the workforce and the world. They also need a wide variety of literacy experiences including rich strategies and texts. Reciprocal teaching techniques complement core reading instruction. It empowers students and increases their exposure to a wide variety of complicated texts, from print to electronic. Information is increasing, and reciprocal teaching can be structured so readers at all levels have access to more difficult texts.

Reciprocal teaching is a guided reading comprehension technique that enhances core reading instruction. This technique involves teaching strategies that have strong effects on student achievement and reveal growth in K-12 instruction. Reciprocal teaching increases student comprehension, engagement, and retention with the power to yield results in student achievement.

In reciprocal teaching, the teacher models four comprehension strategies (summarizing, questioning, clarifying, and predicting) through guided group instruction. When students are confident with the process and strategies, they take turns leading discussions in small groups. In the summarizing component, students lead the group in questions such as, "What happened first, next, and at the end of the passage or story?" They develop concise statements and identify the main idea, key points, and supporting details. They create a summary of what they read.

The clarifying strategy is where the readers assess their own understanding and may have to conduct outside research on unfamiliar words. Students ask and answer questions to clarify or monitor comprehension while reading the text. This helps them to maintain meaning while reading and identify potential difficulties within the text. Students may have trouble understanding unclear sentences or passages, and this strategy is effective in allowing students to analyze these in the group.

Questioning teaches readers to develop critical thinking skills and ask questions throughout the reading process. They question what they are reading and make connections. They answer questions such as, "What do you think?" and "Why did the author say that?" They identify supporting details, and this serves as an integral part of the reciprocal teaching process. Younger students typically ask questions in conversation, and this strategy allows their comprehension to deepen.

Predicting is when students determine what they think they will learn. They activate their prior knowledge and utilize headings, titles, pictures, tables, and diagrams. They make educated guesses and search for clues in the text to predict what may happen. They make inferences on what they think they read.

These strategies are useful in developing reading comprehension skills among students. Hence, teachers must engage in producing reading materials which will discuss the lessons on the reading comprehension strategies. Being an advocate of improving reading performance among students, the researcher formulated intervention projects which will assist her in developing reading comprehension skills. Through the mastered skills in reading, students will be able to achieve their educational goals and make them ready for the grade they are into it. Thus, this study was formulated to evaluate the effectiveness of the four comprehension strategies of reciprocal teaching in enhancing students' achievement in reading in Kananga Central School, Kananga I District, Leyte Division for school year 2023-2024. A proposed improvement plan was formulated based on the result of the study.

It is in the rationale that the researcher who is currently a grade 2 teacher in the above mentioned local, would like to delve worthy research undertaking that will benefit herself, the school she is currently teaching and that of her Graduate Program she is enrolled at.

This study evaluates the evaluate the effectiveness of the four comprehension strategies of reciprocal teaching in enhancing grade two learners' achievement in reading in Kananga Central School, Kananga I District, Leyte Division for School Year 2023-2024. The findings of the study were the basis for the proposed improvement plan.

Specifically, this study sought to answer the following questions:

1. What is the reading performance of the grade two learners before the integration of the four comprehension strategies of reciprocal teaching?

2. What is the reading performance of the grade two learners after the integration of the four comprehension strategies of reciprocal teaching?

3. Is there a significant difference in the reading performance of the grade two learners before and after the integration of the four comprehension strategies of reciprocal teaching?

4. What improvement plan can be proposed based on the findings of this study?

II. METHODOLOGY

Design. This study employed quasi-experimental research design utilizing the pre-test and post-test to evaluate the effectiveness of the four comprehension strategies of reciprocal teaching in enhancing grade two learners' achievement in reading. Kananga Central School, Kananga I District, Leyte Division is the main locale of the study. The 34 grade two learners enrolled in the said locale for School Year 2023-2024 are the main respondents of the study. The instrument used in this study is a researcher-made reading tests which covers the second quarter Most Essential Learning Competencies (MELCs) for Grades two emphasizing the topics on the four comprehension strategies like predicting, questioning, clarifying, and summarizing. This is a 20-item test question. This was conducted before and after the implementation of the four comprehension strategies of reciprocal teaching in reading. Further, the researcher prepared lesson plans in English reading about the concepts or skills in reading comprehension which are predicting, questioning, clarifying, and summarizing. The strategy used in teaching the subject is reciprocal teaching strategies utilizing the differentiated reading materials emphasizing the comprehension skills mentioned in this study. The materials, lesson plans and assessment tools were checked and validated by the District English Coordinator and school Heads before it was administered to the pupils. A Matrix of Activities was formulated to track the progress of the intervention. This research focused on evaluating the effectiveness of the four comprehension strategies of reciprocal teaching in enhancing grade two learners' achievement in reading through the pre-test and post-test and its significant difference. A Proposed Improvement Plan based on the findings of the study is the output.

Sampling. There are 34 grade two learners involved in this study. The research instruments were administered face-to-face with consent from the Local IATF and strictly following the prescribed Health Protocol during the face-to-face classes.

Research Procedure. The researcher prepared the research design and tools utilized in the study. Approval and recommendation from the Panel of Examiner of the Graduate Studies was sought. A letter request to conduct this study

was forwarded to the Office of the Schools Division Superintendent. Upon approval, permission from the District Supervisor and School Head was secured before the actual gathering of data. Orientation of the participants and administration of the pre-test was done during the assessment period for the class after the approval of the permit from the parents of the respondents. Data privacy was emphasized also in the meeting. After accomplishing the pre-test, intervention was given within four weeks. Integration of the four comprehension strategies of reciprocal teaching strategies utilizing differentiated reading materials emphasizing the learning of comprehension skills highlights the delivery of the lesson. The teacher teaches the reading comprehension skills mentioned through the researcher-made reading passages or stories emphasizing the reciprocal teaching where students must discuss among themselves the ideas they get from the story and the teacher facilitates the activity. This gives emphasis on the intervention crafted. After the four-week intervention, the post-test was administered. Results of the tests were collected. Data were tallied and submitted for statistical treatment. Analysis and Interpretation of Data. Making of Proposed Improvement Plan followed.

Ethical Issues. The researcher properly secured the permission to conduct the study from the authorities through written communication. In the formulation of the intervention materials that was used in the study, the use of offensive, discriminatory, or other unacceptable language was avoided. The respondents' names and other personal data were not included in this study to protect their privacy. Participation of the respondents was also voluntary. Orientation was conducted for the respondents with their parents. In the orientation, issues and concerns were addressed and consent to be included in the study were signed. The researcher-maintained objectivity in analyzing and discussing the results. All authors whose works were mentioned in this study were properly quoted and were acknowledged in the reference. Hence, this study focused on the welfare of the learners.

Treatment of Data. **Simple Percentage** was employed to evaluate the reading performance of the grade 2 students before and after the integration of the four comprehension strategies of reciprocal teaching. **t-Test of Mean Difference** was used to determine the significant difference in reading performance of the grade 2 students before and after the integration of the four comprehension strategies of reciprocal teaching.

III. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

TABLE 1

PERFORMANCE OF GRADE TWO LEARNERS IN READING BEFORE THE INTERVENTION

Score Range	Description	PRETEST	
		Frequency	%
17-20	Excellent	0	0
13-16	Very Good	0	0
9-12	Good	0	0
5-8	Fair	0	0
0-4	Poor	34	100
Total		34	100
Weighted Mean		**1.89**	**Poor**

Table 1 presents the reading performance of the grade two learners in reading before the integration of four comprehension strategies of reciprocal teaching. It was revealed on the table that among the 34 grade two learners included in the study achieved a weighted mean of 1.89 which is interpreted as poor before the integration of four comprehension strategies of reciprocal teaching. The poor performance is the result from the researcher-made reading test administered before the integration of four comprehension strategies of reciprocal teaching of which all the grade two learners got a score of 0-4 which is interpreted as poor. This means that these learners find difficulty in achieving the desired learning outcome in the four comprehension strategies which are predicting, questioning, clarifying, and summarizing. It is evident in the result that these learners need to have an intervention to address their learning gaps in literacy. The result implies additional support to the teachers to guide them in formulating instructional interventions. One of the interventions in improving the comprehension skills of the learners is through the integration of reciprocal teaching with the four comprehension strategies. Reciprocal teaching, also known as reciprocal learning, is a strategy that puts the students in charge of the content (Ballinger, 2013 & Iserbyt, 2012). Instead of the teacher reading to the students or having them read out loud during class time, the students are given independent reading time to pursue the material, then given time to discuss what they have read (Guita & Tan, 2018). This type of strategy puts the onus on the students, having them use their minds to take in the content. Then, the teacher helps them start a discussion about the text where they can ask clarifying questions and analyze what they've read.

TABLE 2

**PERFORMANCE OF GRADE TWO LEARNERS IN READING
AFTER THE INTERVENTION**

Score Range	Description	POST TEST	
		Frequency	**%**
17-20	Excellent	6	18
13-16	Very Good	22	64
9-12	Good	6	18
5-8	Fair	0	0
0-4	Poor	0	0
Total		34	100
Weighted Mean		**14.59**	**Very Good**

Table 2 presents the reading performance of the grade two learners after the integration of the four comprehension strategies in reciprocal teaching. It was revealed on the table that the reading performance of the grade two learners after the integration of the four comprehension strategies in reciprocal teaching achieved a weighted mean of 14.59 which is very good. The very good performance is the result from the researcher-made reading test administered after the integration of four comprehension strategies of reciprocal teaching of which 6 or 18% of the 34 grade two pupils got a score of 9-12 which is good, while 22 or 64% got a score of 13-16 which is very good and 6 or 18% got a score of 17-20 which is excellent. The of the researcher-made reading test administered to the grade two learners after the integration of four comprehension strategies in reciprocal teaching shows that learners had improved their performance giving the chance to work independently in their reading activities. In these reading strategies, learners are allowed to come together forming a group of the same reading abilities and encourage them to share the information gathered from the reading activities. The learners must complete the instructional task given to them. The concept of cooperation as being highlighted in this kind of strategy allows every learner to improve their understanding given the chance to explore and listen to the ideas of others. Referring to Oczkus (2010), Peer Learning Reciprocal Teaching describes four predictive

roles, predictor, clarifier, questioner, and summarizer, making it a helpful technique to improve learning difficulties such as: listening, speaking, understanding, decoding, phonetic knowledge, word recognition, comprehension, computation, and problem solving. As early as grade two, learners are given the chance to mentor their peers and provide support to achieve together the desired learning outcome for the grade. According to Mehmood and Alvi (2017) reciprocal teaching enhances students' confidence and persuades them to learn, which in turn improves understanding and academic performance alongside an awareness of weaknesses in areas where they cannot read. Philippa (2019) suggested that teachers should use reciprocal teaching as a teaching method if students can read the text, but do not understand what it means; using reciprocal teaching with students will help to improve comprehension skills (word problems) and critical thinking.

TABLE 3

TEST OF DIFFERENCE IN THE PERFORMANCE OF GRADE TWO LEARNERS IN READING BEFORE AND AFTER THE INTERVENTION

Aspects	Test Scores		Computed T	Critical T	Decision	Interpretation
Grade Two Learners in Reading	Pre Post	1.89 14.59	4.114	0.724	Reject H_o	Significant

Table 3 presents the test of difference in the reading performances of the grade two learners before and after the integration of the four comprehension strategies in reciprocal teaching. It was revealed in the study that the grade two learners achieved an average weighted mean of 1.89 before the integration of the four comprehension strategies in reciprocal teaching and it increases to 14.59 in the post-test. Based on the results of the pre and posttest, the grade two learners were able to achieve a computed value of t of 4.114 which is greater than the critical value of t of 0.724 at 0.05 level of significance, so null hypothesis is rejected. This means that there is a significant difference in the reading performances of the grade two learners before and after the integration of the four comprehension strategies in reciprocal teaching. Integrating teaching in small groups with differentiated reading activities based on the four comprehension strategies like predicting, questioning, clarifying, and summarizing motivates the learners to achieve positive reading performance. Involving the learners in a dialogue with the teachers where they take turns on the role of the teacher leading the discussion about the text had given the learners to confidently explain about the text read. In reciprocal teaching, the learners are encouraged to actively engage with the text, fostering a deeper understanding and improved comprehension skills. From the learning materials used like incorporating images on the text, headlines or introductory statements which guides the learner in knowing and understanding the concepts conveyed in the story and identifying the role that each character in the story stands and selecting a variety of texts or topics which includes fiction, non-fiction, articles, and multimedia are instruments in making the intervention effective. Hence, researchers encourage every teacher to apply or adopt reciprocal teaching techniques to improve the reading comprehension skills of the learners. According to the new definition of reading, reading is an interactive process in which readers engage with the text while drawing on their existing knowledge, is where Reciprocal Teaching most closely matches with the definition. By drawing on prior knowledge, readers can discover new facts, fundamental concepts, and points of contention. Most importantly, readers create meaning from the text by paralleling, contrasting, or affirming what the author suggests. This is a structure that all excellent readers employ. Otherwise, the text would just be a bunch of random letters on the page. Learning cannot take place if meaning is not constructed. Reciprocal Teaching is a cooperative and constructivist learning model (Penuel et al., 2020).

IV. CONCLUSION

The study revealed a significant difference in the reading performances of the grade two learners before and after the integration of the four comprehension strategies in reciprocal teaching. Integrating teaching in small groups with differentiated reading activities based on the four comprehension strategies like predicting, questioning, clarifying, and summarizing motivates the learners to achieve positive reading performance. Involving the learners in a dialogue with the teachers where they take turns on the role of the teacher leading the discussion about the text had given the learners to confidently explain about the text read. In reciprocal teaching, the learners are encouraged to actively engage with the text, fostering a deeper understanding and improved comprehension skills. From the learning materials used like incorporating images on the text, headlines or introductory statements which guides the learner in knowing and understanding the concepts conveyed in the story and identifying the role that each character in the story stands and selecting a variety of texts or topics which includes fiction, non-fiction, articles, and multimedia are instruments in making the intervention effective. Hence, researchers encourage every teacher to apply or adopt reciprocal teaching techniques to improve the reading comprehension skills of the learners.

V. RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Utilize the proposed improvement plan formulated.

2. In teaching reading comprehension, teachers are encouraged to be innovative and take the chance to make use of the potential of the learners to achieve the desired learning outcomes.

3. Teachers must start in an early grade in allowing the learners to explore and develop their confidence through the giving of the role of a teacher where they are encouraged to speak and discuss what they get from the text they read.

4. School heads must provide support to the teachers through the provision of materials to produce reading activities to be used by the teacher in teaching the subject.

5. School heads must conduct monitoring through instructional supervision and provide technical assistance based on the needs of the teachers and learners.

6. Stakeholders must assist the teachers through the provision of reading materials and articles which helps the learners to develop a love for reading.

7. Teachers and school administrators must conduct monitoring and regular assessment to track the progress of the learners and provide utmost support to learners with difficulty in doing the task given, and

8. Future researchers should replicate this study to include different locales and include different variables aside from the mentioned in this study.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

REFERENCES

[1]   A. Kadian, The relation between academic achievement, executive function, intelligence, and metacognition, Int. J. Indian Psychol. 3 (4) (2016) 166–174.

[2]   A. Ursache, W. Wedin, A. Tirsi, A. Convit, Preliminary evidence for obesity and elevations in fasting insulin mediating associations between cortisol awakening response and hippocampal volumes and frontal atrophy, Psych Neuroendocrinol. 37 (8) (2012) 1270–1276, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.psyneuen.2011.12.020.

[3]   A. Zaman, Effects of reciprocal teaching on students' achievement in physics at secondary level, J. Sci. Educ. 1 (2) (2019) 31–44.

[4]   Abas, M., E. Solihatin, Nadiroh, (2019). the effect of reciprocal instructional models and interpersonal intelligence on the student learning outcomes of social science education, Int. J. Engin. Adv. Technol. 8 (5C) (2019) 427–433, https://doi.org/10.35940/ijeat.E1060.0585C19.

[5]   Abdul Ameer, M.S. (2017). The effect of using teaching exchange strategy in acquiring biology for the second intermediate female students, J. College of Basic Educ./ Univ.Babylon 33 (2017) 432–449.

[6]   Agoro, A.A. & Akinsola, M.K. (2013). Effectiveness of reflective- reciprocal teaching on pre-service teachers' achievement and science process skills in integrated science, Int. J. Educ. Res. 1 (8) (2013) 1–20.

[7]   Al – Shalhoub, S.A. (2013). The use of reciprocal teaching strategy in the teaching of mathematics and its impact on the achievement and mathematical communication and the survival of the impact of learning for middle school students, J. Educ. Sci. 25 (3) (2013) 645–673.

[8]   Al Shshaw, S.Z. (2018). The effect of Reciprocal Teaching strategy on achievement and thinking Metacognition skill among educational science students, College of Educ. Human Sci.\ Univ. AL-Basra 38 (2018) 877–901.

[9]   Alemu, M. (2020). improving secondary school students physics achievement using reciprocal peer tutoring: a multi-level quasi-experimental study, Eurasia J. Math. Sci. Technol. Educ. 16 (4) (2020), em1832, https://doi.org/10.29333/ejmste/115164.

[10]   Al-Harby, J.S.S. (2016). The effect of reciprocal-teaching strategy on learning outcomes and attitudes of qassim-university students in islamic culture, J. Educ. Practice 7 (6) (2016) 213–231.

[11]   Al-Saraireh, A.M.F. (2013). Effective use of reciprocal teaching strategy in the development of academic achievement and skill of solving problems in geography for sixth-grade female students in the Hashemite Kingdom of Jordan, Int. J. Acad. Res. Psychol. B 5 (4) 435–444, https://doi.org/10.7813/2075-4124.2013/ 5-4/B.63.

[12]   Bakare, J. & Orji, C.T. (2018). Effects of reciprocal peer tutoring and direct learning environment on sophomores' academic achievement in electronic and computer fundamentals, Educ. Inform. Technol. (2018) 1–21, https://doi.org/10.1007/s10639-018-9808-1.

[13]   Ballinger, S.G. (2013). Towards a cross-linguistic pedagogy: biliteracy and reciprocal learning strategies in French immersion, J. Immers. Content-Based Lang. Educ. 1 (1) 131–148.

[14]   C. Hall, P.K. Steinle, S. Vaughn, Reading instruction for English learners with learning disabilities: what do we already know, and what do we still need to learn? New Directions for Child and Adolescent Dev. (166) (2019) 145–189, https://doi.org/10.1002/cad.20302.

[15]   Capanzana, C.O. & Avilla, R.A. (2017). Reciprocal teaching approach with self-regulated learning (RT-SRL): effects on students' reading comprehension, achievement and self-regulation in Chemistry, The Normal Lights 11 (2) (2017) 31–59.

[16]   Dadabhoy, K. & Dadabhoy, M. (2021). Implementation of reciprocal teaching strategies: improving reading skills and academic performance of secondary students, Review of Appl. Manag. Soc. Sci. 4 (3) (2021) 751–760.

[17]   Erwanto, A.S. Maryatmi, A. Budiyanto, The effects of reciprocal teaching learning strategy and self efficacy on learning outcomes of early childhood (AUD) mathematical logic, Al-Jabar: Jurnal Pendidikan Matematika. 9 (1) (2018) 41–50, https://doi.org/10.24042/ajpm.v9i1.2567.

[18]   Ginga, U.A., Mohammed, B. & Usman, N. (2019). Effect of reciprocal teaching strategy on students' performance in word problem leading to simultaneous equations for creativity in basic, secondary, tertiary education in Yobe state, Abacus 44 (1) (2019) 20–259.

[19]   Glaser, A., Samuel, J. & Yeager, (1990). All Things are not equal: the value of business incentives, Pol. Stud. J. 18 (3) 553–572, https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1541- 0072.1990.tb00616.x.

[20]   Guita, G.B. & Tan, D.A. (2018). Mathematics anxiety and students' academic achievement in a reciprocal learning environment, Int. J. English and Educ. 7 (3) 112–124.

[21]   H.A.M. Shaffril, N. Ahmad, M.E. Hamdan, A.A. Samah, S.F. Samsuddin, Systematic literature review on adaptation towards climate change impacts among indigenous people in the asia pacific regions, J. Cleaner Product. (2020), 120595, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2020.120595.

[22]   Henry, O.T. (2018). Effects of reciprocal instructional strategy on junior secondary school students' performance in basic science in ekiti state, Nigeria, Int. J. Adv. Acad. Res. | Arts, Humanit. Educ. 4 (6) (2018) 6–14.

[23]   Hou, Y.-J. (2015). Reciprocal teaching, metacognitive awareness, and academic performance in Taiwanese junior college students, Int. J. Teach. Educ. 3 (4) (2015) 15–32, https://doi.org/10.20472/TE.2015.3.4.003.

[24]   Iserbyt, P. (2012). Reciprocal learning, in: N.M. Seel (Ed.), Encyclopedia of the Sciences of Learning, Springer, Boston, MA, https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4419- 1428-6_1882.

[25]   J.K. Bilgoon, The effectiveness of reciprocal teaching in developing scientific meta-reading skills and enhancing academic achievement among gifted and under-achievers in primary school's students, J. Educ. Psychol. Sci. 18 (1) (2017) 302–339, https://doi.org/10.12785/JEPS/180110.

[26]   J.R. García, K. Cain, Decoding and reading comprehension: a meta-analysis to identify which reader and assessment characteristics influence the strength of the relationship in English, Review of Educational Research 84 (1) (2014) 74–111, https://doi.org/10.3102/0034654313499616.

[27]   K. Flemming, M. Briggs, Electronic searching to locate qualitative research: evaluation of three strategies, J. Adv. Nurs. 57 (1) (2007) 95–100, https://doi.org/ 10.1111/j.1365-2648.2006.04083.x.

[28]   K. Meyer, Making meaning in mathematics problem-solving using the reciprocal teaching approach, Literacy Learning: The Middle Years 22 (2) (2014) 7–14.

[29]   Komariah, E., Ramadhona, P.A. & Silviyanti, T.M. (2015). Improving reading comprehension through reciprocal teaching method, Studies in English Lang. Educ. 2 (2) (2015) 87–102, https://doi.org/10.24815/SIELE.V2I2.2693.

[30]   L. De Backer, H. Keer, M. Valcke, Exploring the potential impact of reciprocal peer tutoring on higher education students 'meta-cognitive knowledge and regulation, Int J Learn Sci 40 (3) (2012) 559–588, https://doi.org/10.1007/s11251-011-9190-5.

[31]   L. De Backer, H. Van Keer, B. Moerkerke, M. Valcke, Examining evolutions in the adoption of metacognitive regulation in reciprocal peer tutoring groups, Metacognit. Learning 11 (2) (2016) 187–213, https://doi.org/10.1007/s11409-015-9141-7.

[32]   M. Kulkarni, Benefits of ICT-Based Learning Strategies for Students, Lulu Publication, Raleigh, 2016.

[33]   M. Rusli, N.S. Degeng, P. Setyosari, Sulton, Peer teaching: students teaching students to increase academic performance, Teaching Theology & Religion 24 (1) (2021) 17–27, https://doi.org/10.1111/teth.12549.

[34]   M. Takala, The effects of reciprocal teaching on reading comprehension in mainstream and special (SLI) education, Scandin. J. Educ. Res. 50 (5) (2006) 559–576, https://doi.org/10.1080/00313830600953824.

[35]   M.E. Kiger, L. Varpio, Thematic analysis of qualitative data: AMEE Guide No. 131, Med. Teacher (2020) 1–9, https://doi.org/10.1080/ 0142159x.2020.1755030.

[36]   M.Y. Ganai, A. Maqbool, A Study of Self-Concept, Mental Health and Academic Achievement of Orphan and Non-orphan Adolescents, Anchor Academic Publishing, Hamburg, 2016.

[37]   M.Y.A. AlSaraireh, K.M.N.K. Hamid, The effect of the reciprocal teaching model on developing Jordanian students' reading comprehension at mutah university, Int. J. Linguist. 8 (6) (2016) 69–93, https://doi.org/10.5296/ijl.v8i6.10448.

[38]   Mehmood, S. & Alvi, M.M. (2017). Effectiveness of reciprocal teaching versus traditional teaching, Int. J. Sci. Res. 73 (5) (2017) 135–159.

[39]   Mulbar, U., A. Zaki, Nurwahidah, (2019). an experiment of reciprocal teaching model in higher education, J. Physics: Confer. Series 1317 (2019), 012134, https://doi. org/10.1088/1742-6596/1317/1/012134.

[40]   Muthik, A., Muchyidin, A. & Persada, A.R., (2022). The Effectiveness of students learning motivation on learning outcomes using the reciprocal teaching learning model, J. General Educ. Humanit. 1 (1) (2022) 21–30.

[41]   N.R. Haddaway, B. Macura, P. Whaley, ROSES Reporting standards for Systematic Evidence Syntheses: pro forma, flow-diagram and descriptive summary of the plan and conduct of environmental systematic reviews and systematic maps, Environ Evid 7 (7) (2018), https://doi.org/10.1186/s13750-018-0121-7.

[42]   Oczkus, L. (2010). Reciprocal teaching, powerful hands-on comprehension strategy, The Utah Journal of Literacy 16 (1) (2010) 34–38.

[43]   Oo, T.Z., Magyar, A., & Hab´ok, A. (2021). Effectiveness of the reflection-based reciprocal teaching approach for reading comprehension achievement in upper secondary school in Myanmar, Asia Pac. Educ. Rev. 22 675–698, https://doi.org/10.1007/s12564-021-09707-8.

[44]   Palincsar, A. & Brown, A. (1984) Reciprocal teaching of Comprehension - fostering and comprehension-monitoring activities, Cognit. InStruct. 1 (2) 117–175, https://doi.org/10.1207/s1532690xci0102_1.

[45]   Phillipa, J.Q. (2019). Using Reciprocal Teaching (Master Thesis), Massey University, New Zeeland, 2010. Retrieved November 15, 2019, from, https://muir.massey.ac. nz/bitstream/handle/10179/2247/02_whole.pdf.

[46]   Putra, L.J. (2021). Using reciprocal teaching method to improve female students' reading comprehension achievement at SMA negeri tujuh prabumulih, Holistics J. 13 (1) (2021) 47–55.

[47]   Q.N. Hong, A. Gonzalez-Reyes, P. Pluye, Improving the usefulness of a tool for appraising the quality of qualitative, quantitative and mixed methods studies, the Mixed Methods Appraisal Tool (MMAT), J. Evaluat. Clinical Practice 24 (3) (2018) 459–467, https://doi.org/10.1111/jep.12884.

[48]   R. Bridgestock, The graduate attributes we've overlooked: enhancing graduate employ ability through career management skills, High Educ Res Dev 28 (1) (2009) 31–44, https://doi.org/10.1080/07294360802444347.

[49]   R. Steinmayr, A. Meißner, A.F. Weidinger, L. Wirthwein, Academic Achievement, Oxford Bibliographies, 2014, https://doi.org/10.1093/OBO/9780199756810- 0108.

[50]   R. Whittemore, K. Knafl, The integrative review: updated methodology, J. Adv. Nursing 52 (5) (2005) 546–553, https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365- 2648.2005.03621.x.

[51]   R.W. Penuel, R. Riedy, S.M. Barber, Principles of collaborative education research with stakeholders: toward requirements for a new research and development infrastructure, Review of Educ. Res. 9 (5) (2020) 627–674, https://doi.org/10.3102/0034654320938126.

[52]   S. Bachtiar, S. Zubaidah, A.D. Corebima, S.E. Indriwati, The spiritual and social attitudes of students towards integrated problem-based learning models, Issues in Educ. Res. 28 (2) (2018) 254–270.

[53]   S. Gazula, L. McKenna, S. Cooper, P. Paliadelis, A systematic review of Reciprocal Peer Tutoring within tertiary health profession educational programs, Health Prof. Educ. 3 (2) (2017) 64–78, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.hpe.2016.12.001.

[54]   Sundahry, Y. Fitria, Rakimahwati, (2018). The effect reciprocal teaching strategy of critical thinking skills in learning tematic class V, Int. Conf. Educ. Soc. Sci. Technol. (2018) 816–822, https://doi.org/10.29210/20181118.

[55]   Umi Irawan, R., Bunau, E. & Suhartono, L. (2015). The Effectiveness of Reciprocal Teaching Technique in Teaching Reading Narrative Text to the Eight Grade Students, English Language Education Study Program of FKIP UNTAN Pontianak, 2015, pp. 1–11.

[56]   Yuliyanti, N., Hikmah, S. & Masrupi, M. (2018). The Influence of Reciprocal Teaching Strategy and Reading Habit toward Students' Achievement on Reading Comprehension at the Eight Grade of Mts Al Hasyimiyah, PROCEEDING AISELT (Annual International Seminar on English Language Teaching), 2018, pp. 390–402.

[57]   Zubaidah, S., Mahanal, S., Sholihah, M., Rosyida, F. & Kurniawati, Z.L. (2020). Using remap RT (Reading - concept mapping – reciprocal teaching) learning model to improve low-ability students' achievement in biology, CEPS J. 10 (3) (2020) 117–144, https://doi.org/10.25656/01:20788.